What does academic research have to say about college accountability?

David Deming
Harvard University and NBER
September 2014
Some Design Principles

- Campbell’s Law (1976)
  - "The more any quantitative social indicator is used for social decision-making, the more subject it will be to corruption pressures and the more apt it will be to distort and corrupt the social processes it is intended to monitor."
  - This means that you cannot use a measure for both accountability and diagnosis

- Kerr (1975) – “On the folly of rewarding A, while hoping for B”

- For college accountability, what is B?

- Must define the problem
  - In other words, why isn’t the market already working well?
  - Need to diagnose well to come up with the right solution
Lessons from accountability in other settings

• Job Training – JTPA (Heckman, Heinrich and Smith 2002)
  – Short-term employment impacts had zero correlation with long-term employment and earnings

• Health care
  – Risk adjustment
  – Surgeon report cards - take on less risky cases to preserve rating (Leventis 1997)

• K-12 education
  – Large increases in high-stakes scores; small/mixed impacts on low-stakes scores (Dee and Jaco 2009; many others)
  – Lots of strategic behavior – although systems have gotten smarter
  – Long-run benefits, but only for kids in lowest rated schools (Deming, Cohodes, Jennings and Jencks 2014)
Linking funding to outcomes

• Directly conflicts with an open access mission.
  – Students who start farther back are less likely to “pay off” for the school.
  – Need to adjust for differences prior to enrollment in the likelihood of success. Otherwise schools will just skim the cream off the top.

• Some possible strategic responses
  – Too much focus on employer-sponsored programs (job is guaranteed)
  – Under-investment in basic skills (costs more resources to make students employable)
  – “come back when you know exactly what you want to do”

• Need to get the “risk adjustment” right.
  – Could use prior earnings, or perhaps placement test scores.
  – Look to past experience in other settings – we’ve been here before!